

Appl. No. 09/887,887
Docket No. CM2385
Amndt. dated 6/16/08
Reply to Office Action mailed on 12/14/07
Customer No. 27752

7
RECEIVED
CENTRAL FAX CENTER
JUN 16 2008

REMARKS

Claim Status

Claims 1-8, 10-12, 14-17, 19-24, 26-28 and 30-32 are currently under consideration. Claim 7 has been amended to correct a typographical error. Claim 7 now depends from Claim 1. No new matter has been added.

Rejection Under 35 USC §103(a)

Claims 1-8, 12 and 14-32 stand rejected under 35 USC §103(a) as being unpatentable over U.S. Patent 4,725,489 to Jones et al. (hereinafter "Jones") in view of U.S. Patent 4,117,187 to Adams et al. (hereinafter "Adams"). Applicants respectfully traverse the rejection. A *prima facie* case of obviousness has not been established because there no motivation to combine the references in the manner suggested by the Office Action. Specifically, there is no motivation for one skilled in the art to use the acids disclosed by Adams in the composition of Jones.

The proposed modification cannot render the prior art unsatisfactory for its intended purpose (See MPEP 2143.01). Jones requires his composition to have a higher pH. In Column 8, lines 23-25, Jones states, "It is necessary that the pH of the extracted solution be on the alkaline side, within a range of about 8 to about 12, preferably from 9 to 11." Jones also discusses adding ammonium, sodium or potassium hydroxide to "achieve the desired alkalinity level" (Col. 8, lines 35-38). In Col. 2, lines 4-13, Jones states (bold and underlining added for emphasis):

In designing a product which will satisfactorily work as a one-step disposable wipe and not leave behind film or streaks, there are number of variables to manage. These include the composition of the substrate itself, the absorbent characteristics of the substrate, the loading level of liquid onto the substrate, the components of the liquid composition, the pH of the liquid, etc. All of these factors are interrelated and it has been found that close control is necessary in order to obtain a satisfactory product.

Clearly, Jones believes that an alkaline pH is necessary to obtain a "satisfactory product." Adams teaches using acids to create an acid pH level (see Col. 5, lines 3-8). One skilled in the art would not use the acids of Adams in Jones' composition. Creating an acid pH

Appl. No. 09/887,887
Docket No. CM2385
Amdt. dated 6/16/08
Reply to Office Action mailed on 12/14/07
Customer No. 27752


8

in Jones' composition would make it unsatisfactory. Applicants contend that a *prima facie* case of obviousness has not been established. As a result, Applicants respectfully contend that their claimed composition is novel and unobvious and that the rejection under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) should be withdrawn.

Conclusion

This response represents an earnest effort to place the present application in proper form and to distinguish the invention as claimed from the applied reference. In view of the foregoing, reconsideration of this application, and allowance of the pending claim is respectfully requested.

Respectfully submitted,

By: 
Brent M. Peebles
Registration No. 38,576
(513) 627-6773

Dated: June 16, 2008
Customer No. 27752